

**SRU MATCH OFFICIALS' SELECTION COMMITTEE  
INTERIM REPORT TO SRRA EXECUTIVE  
NOVEMBER 2012**

## **Background**

The 2012 Report of the Review Group set up to conduct a Review of Match Officials recommended the following with particular reference to the Selection Panel: -

1. There was acceptance of the role and the need for a Selection Panel;
2. The Selection Panel should provide a brief update report after each meeting to help improve transparency and communication;
3. The Selection Panel should include experienced officials and a former club coach;
4. The membership of the Selection Panel should be reviewed on a regular basis

## **Selection Panel Membership**

Following my appointment as chair of the Selection Panel, I held meetings with Roy McCombe, SRU's Head of Match Officials and Jim Yuille, chair of the Review Group to discuss the possible make-up of the new Selection Panel. It was agreed that the Selection Panel should comprise the following:-

Chair  
High Performance Group Manager  
SRU Referee Group Manager  
SRU Assistant Referee Group Manager  
Ex Senior Official  
Ex Club Coach  
Analyst

Following advertisement both internally and externally as required, the make up of the Selection Panel was finalised as follows:-

Jim Fleming (Chair)  
Rob Dickson (High Performance Group Manager)  
Andy Macpherson (SRU Referee Group Manager)  
Colin Brett (SRU Assistant Referee Group Manager)  
Ronnie Dumma (ex Senior Official)  
Adam Gray (ex Club Coach)  
Stuart Thomson (Analyst)

Excluding Rob Dickson, Andy Macpherson and Colin Brett who are on the Selection Panel due to their respective positions within the Union, the other members of the Selection Panel will hold their positions for an initial period of three years (which can be extended for a further 3 year period thereafter).

## **Selection Panel Philosophy**

At its first meeting in early August, the Selection Panel agreed that its main role was basically two-fold namely:-

- To service the domestic game and
- To assist the development of Scottish officials

To assist in the achievement of its role the following points were agreed by the Panel:-

- Selectors would watch and report on referees
- Matches would be allocated taking cognisance of all possible information including the importance of a particular match, referees' coaching reports, assistant referees' coaching reports, selectors' reports, internal and external PR reports, club feedback reports, statistical analyses etc
- All referees and assistant referees would be required to reach appropriate fitness levels. Failure to reach an acceptable level would affect appointments.
- Commitment of referees and assistant referees would be taken into consideration when making appointments or when considering referee/assistant referee regradings.

The Panel meets on the first Tuesday of each month to discuss all match officials' performances. At this meeting refereeing and assistant refereeing appointments are made for all matches (excluding IRB international appointments and ERC refereeing appointments both of which are outwith the remit of the Panel) for the following month

## **High Performance Group Officials**

As of the beginning of the season, there were six referees on the group namely Peter Allan, Andrew Macpherson, James Matthew, Andrew McMenemy, Neil Paterson and Cammy Rudkin. The two HP ARs on the group were Graeme Marshall and Bob Nevins. The two HP TMOs were Jim Yuille and Iain Ramage whilst the HP coaches were Bill Calder and Colin High.

In addition, David Changleng is invited to join meetings of the group given his experience in International, European and domestic rugby. Johnny Bacigalupo is also invited to meetings in his position as Senior Academy Coach to ensure consistency of approach to those referees in the Senior Academy.

Due to decisions made at the ERC Match Officials' Sub Committee prior to the beginning of the current season with regards succession planning, the Selection Panel confirmed that only Neil Paterson, Andrew McMenemy and James Matthew would initially be considered to referee in the Rabo League. Andrew Macpherson and Peter Allan are

included within the group to support the other HP referees in ERC matches, AR to a consistently high standard in Rabo and ERC matches, contribute to the HP Group meetings in a supportive and developmental way. They may be appointed to referee Rabo League matches in an “emergency”.

James Matthew was injured towards the end of last season and is only just back refereeing in the Premiership so his name doesn't appear in the table below, whilst Graeme Marshall has also been injured and has only just passed the fitness requirements.

List of appointments (excluding domestic league and home B+I Cup matches) for HP Group members up to the end of November 2012.

	International	Heineken Cup	Amlin CC	Rabo	B+I Cup or Exchanges
Peter Allan	1 (AR)	0	1 (AR)	1 + 2 (AR)	0
Andrew Macpherson	0	0	2 (AR)	4 (AR)	0
Andrew McMenemy	1 (AR)	0	2	5 + 1 (AR)	0
Neil Paterson	2 (AR)	2	0	4 + 1 (AR)	0
Cammy Rudkin	0	0	0	1 (AR)	2
Charles Samson	0	0	0	0	2
Adrian Graves (AR)	0	1	1	3	0
Bob Nevins (AR)	0	1	0	6	0
Iain Ramage (TMO)	1	1	0	3	0
Jim Yuille (TMO)	3	1	0	3	0

In addition to the above appointments, the following invitations, with the officials appointed by the Selection Panel, were accepted.

Grenoble v Perpignan (French Top 14) – Neil Paterson (Referee)  
 Basque Selection v Japan (Tour Game) – Andrew McMenemy (Referee), Andrew Macpherson & Adrian Graves (ARs)  
 Newcastle “A” v Gloucester “A” (RFU “A” League) – Cammy Rudkin

*At their November meeting, the Selection panel promoted Charles Samson to the High Performance Group and Adrian Graves to the High Performance Assistant Referees' Group.*

## **SRU Refereeing Group**

The SRU Refereeing Group at the beginning of the season comprised the following referees: -

### Grade 2

Jean-Marie Burel, Alan Campbell, David Changleng, Rob Dickson, Gary Gordon, Iain Heard, Andy Ireland, Charles Samson (Senior Academy) Johann van der Merwe and Kevin White (Senior Academy). *Since the beginning of the season Jean-Marie Burel has stepped back for the remainder of the season for domestic reasons. At the November Selection Panel Meeting, Charles Samson was promoted to the HP Group.*

### Grade 3

Malcolm Gray, Mhairi Hay and Lloyd Linton (Senior Academy). *Since the beginning of the season Malcolm Gray has decided to retire whilst Lloyd Linton has recently gone to Australia for ten weeks as part of his medical training*

### Grade 4

Martin Hose, Tom McNicol, Neil Muir, Alex Pratt, Colin Reavley, Dan Shaw, Damian Timson, Graeme Wells and George Whitecross. *At its November meeting the Selection Panel promoted Graeme Wells to Grade 3*

In addition the following referees were nominated by their districts and were available for appointment if required

Frazer Balharry (CRRS), Colin Brett (ERRS), Malcolm Changleng (BRRS), Mike Goodman (ERRS), Nathan Kearns (ERRS), Dunx McClement (WRRS), Iain Morrison (WRRS), Henry Stuart (CRRS), Scott Tomlinson (BRRS), Ali Watt (WRRS) and Paul Williams (CRRS) – *since the beginning of the season Malcolm Changleng has intimated that he didn't wish to be considered for appointments. At its November meeting the Selection Panel promoted Nathan Kearns to Grade 4 and added him to the SRU Referee Panel List*

List of appointments (excluding domestic league and home B+I Cup matches) for SRU Referees up to the end of November 2012. There were no AR appointments in the noted categories other than those noted earlier in this report.

	International	Heineken Cup	Rabo	B+I Cup	Exchanges
Dave Changleng	1 (AR)	2 (AR)	3 (AR)	0	0
Iain Heard	0	0	1 (TMO)	0	0
Andy Ireland	0	0	1 (TMO)	0	0
Lloyd Linton	0	0	0	0	1
Johann van der Merwe	0	0	0	2	0
Kevin White	0	0	0	0	1

### **SRU Assistant Refereeing Group**

As of 1<sup>st</sup> August 2012, the list of SRU Assistant Referees Group was as follows (HP ARs noted in HP Group): -

#### High Performance Development Group

Ian Bruce, Adrian Graves and Archie McNally – *At its November Meeting, the Selection Panel moved Adrian Graves into the High Performance Group*

#### Group 1

Graham Allen, Willie Anderson, Brian Darling, Digby Thomas

## Group 2

Gary Duncan, Graeme Eastland, Ben Evans, Walter Gaffney, Stephen Hart, Andrew Laing, Andy Law, Kevin McGhee, Don McPherson, Bill Mitchell, Brett Primrose, Brian Taylor, Gus Tweedale, Stephen Ward and David Wright - *Since the start of season John Beaton and Rab McHenry have been added to the group.*

## Trial Group

Derek Paton

### **Commitment**

The Selection Panel has concerns about the high level of unavailability shown since the start of the season. We would ask all match officials to revisit their availability in order to reduce the amount of changes requiring to be made once appointments are published.

### **General**

The Review Group recommended that the Selection Panel should provide a brief update report after each meeting to help improve transparency and communication. Whilst appreciating the rationale behind this recommendation, it is felt by the Panel that it would be more beneficial to produce only three detailed reports per season (end of November, end of February and end of May). Following discussions with Jim Yuille, chair of the Review Group, and John McLaughlin, chair of the SRRA Executive it was agreed that the Selection Panel Reports would be presented at the SRRA Executive Meetings for information and discussion and thereafter be published on WTR for general circulation.

In addition to these detailed reports, it would be my intention to publish, again via WTR, any changes the Selection Panel make to match officials gradings or any other relevant issues.

### **Conclusion**

As chair of the Selection Panel, I would like to record my thanks to my fellow members of the panel for the commitment they have shown and work they have put in since the start of the season. From a relatively standing start, the Selection Panel have in a short period of time become a very effective and efficient group ensuring that appointments and gradings are based on performance (no matter the level of referee or game), fitness and commitment. Succession planning is also high on our list of priorities as the season progresses. It also gratifying to note the detailed communication which takes place between the relevant managers on the Selection Panel and their officials.

Although much has been achieved in a short time frame, there is still much to do. At present, the Selection Panel has the following items for its immediate attention and action

- Revisiting the existing criteria for regrading of referees and assistant referees (to be published on WTR when complete);
- Revisiting the reporting form used by Selectors;
- Performance Measurement criteria for all Match Officials

I thank you for taking the time to read this interim report and I am, of course, available to answer any questions or to clarify any points

Jim Fleming  
Chair of the SRU Match Officials' Selection Panel  
November 2012