Background

As recommended by the 2012 Referee Review Group and as agreed with SRRA Executive, I present the 1st interim report from the SRU’s Match Officials’ Selection Panel for season 2013/14.

Selection Panel Membership

The membership of the Selection Panel for season 2013/14 is as follows:

- Jim Fleming (Chairman)
- Rob Dickson (High Performance Group Manager)
- Colin Brett (SRU Referee & Assistant Referee Group Manager)
- Iain Heard (SRU Referee Academy Manager)
- Ronnie Dumma (ex Senior Official)
- Adam Gray (ex Senior Club Coach)
- Stuart Thomson (Analyst)

Andy Macpherson left the panel at the end of last season when he assumed his position as a high performance coach. He was replaced by Iain Heard, the SRU Referee Academy Manager.

Excluding Colin Brett, Rob Dickson and Iain Heard who are employees of the SRU, the other members of the Selection Panel are in their second year of an initial three-year appointment (which appointment can be extended for a further 3 year period thereafter)

Terms of Reference

The terms of reference for the Selection Panel are detailed within the Match Officials’ Information/Protocols Document for Season 2013/14 (Pages 15 and 16).

Selection Panel Philosophy

The main remit of the Selection Panel are:

- To service the domestic game and
- To assist with the development of Scottish officials through the appointment system

To assist in the attainment of the Selection Panel’s remit, the following has been agreed:

- A group of experienced performance reviewers would be created to watch and report directly to the Selection Panel on the performance of referees and, as appropriate, ARs.
- Certain selectors would watch and report on the performance of referees.
- Matches would be allocated taking cognisance of all possible information including the importance of a particular match, performance reviewers and selectors’ reports,
assistant referees’ coaching reports, external PR reports, club feedback reports and any statistical analyses.

- Referees and assistant referees would be required to reach appropriate fitness levels.
- Commitment would be taken into consideration when making appointments or when considering referee/assistant referee repositionings.

The Panel meets on the first Tuesday of each month throughout the season to discuss match officials’ performances. At this meeting refereeing, assistant refereeing and performance reviewer appointments are made for matches under the Selection Panel’s jurisdiction. Matches are generally announced on a fortnightly basis although this period might alter depending on circumstances. (NB IRB international appointments and ERC refereeing appointments are both outwith the remit of the Panel).

The Selection Panel has agreed various criteria of which cognisance will be taken with regards the repositioning of both referees and assistant referees. These criteria are available via WTR (in the case of referees) and via the coaching handbook (in the case of ARs).

**High Performance Group Officials**

At the beginning of the season there were six referees on the HP Group, namely Peter Allan, Sam Grove-White, Lloyd Linton, Andrew McMenemy, Neil Paterson and Charles Samson. Sam Grove-White, Lloyd Linton, Andrew McMenemy and Charles Samson were also members of the 6 Nations’ Development Squad which is managed by Dave Pearson, the 6 Nations Elite Referee Development Coach. Dave is also the lead coach to those in the development squad.

The group also consists of three Assistant Referees, namely Adrian Graves, Graeme Marshall and Bob Nevins. In addition, there are two TMOs, Iain Ramage and Jim Yuille whilst the HP referee coaches are Colin High and Andrew Macpherson.

At the Selection Panel Meeting in November 2013, the Selection Panel were informed that Dave Pearson had decided to remove Charles Samson from the 6 Nations Development Squad. Since one of the criteria for being included within the HP group is membership of Development Squad, the Selection Panel agree to reposition Charles from the HP group to the Academy at grade 2.

Both Neil Paterson and Andrew McMenemy have performed well at European and Rabo games whilst unfortunately Lloyd Linton picked up an injury in September and is only shortly due to start refereeing again. Sam Grove-White continues to progress with his development programme and Peter Allan acts as an AR at professional level and referees regularly in the Premiership.

The ARs and TMOs within the group are regularly appointed to professional games with both Iain Ramage and Jim Yuille being appointed to Autumn International matches.
The appointments (excluding domestic league and home B+I Cup matches) for HP Group members up to the end of November 2013 are noted below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Internals (IRB + FIRA)</th>
<th>Heineken Cup</th>
<th>Amlin CC</th>
<th>Rabo</th>
<th>B+I Cup or Exchanges</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peter Allan</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2 (AR)</td>
<td>2 (AR)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sam Grove – White</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lloyd Linton</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andrew McMenemey</td>
<td>2 (AR)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neil Paterson</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4 + 3 (AR)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adrian Graves (AR)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graham Marshall</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bob Nevins (AR)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iain Ramage (TMO)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Yuille (TMO)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Six Nations Development Squad**

Dave Pearson, the ex International Referee, was appointed as the Six Nations Elite Referee Coach in late 2012. Dave’s primary role is to raise the standard and quality of elite referees across the Six Nations. Dave’s initial focus is to work with referees from Italy and Scotland and one of his first tasks was to create a development squad of referees who had the possible potential of becoming future international referees.

In conjunction with the Selection Panel, it was agreed that the following referees would become part of the development squad: -

- Sam Grove-White
- Lloyd Linton
- Andrew McMenemey
- Charles Samson

During November 2013, Dave Pearson intimated that, due to his performances Charles Samson would no longer be part of the squad
The SRU Refereeing Group as at the beginning of the season comprised the following referees:

**Grade 2**
David Changleng, Rob Dickson, Gary Gordon, Iain Heard, Andy Ireland, James Matthew and Cammy Rudkin.

**Grade 3**
Mhairi Hay, Neil Muir, Dan Shaw (Academy), Graeme Wells (Academy) and Kevin White.

**Grade 4**
Craig Clark, Gordon Corry (Academy), Lee Fish, Martin Hose, Nathan Kearns, Duncan McClement (Academy), Tom McNicol, Alex Pratt, Colin Reavley, Damian Timson, Alistair Watt and George Whitecross. Unfortunately Nathan Kearns had to return to Australia shortly after the season commenced.

**District Nominations**
In addition to the SRU list of referees, the following were nominated by their districts as being capable of refereeing at Championship level and were available for appointment if required:

Frazer Balharry (CRRS), Alan Campbell (WRRS), Ted Coutts (CRRS), Paul Cyphus (ERRS), Richard Downing (ERRS), Michael Downing (WRRS), Iain Morrison (WRRS), Iain Rogerson (BRRS), John Shaw (WRRS), Henry Stuart (CRRS), Scott Tomlinson (BRRS) and Paul Williams (CRRS).

Since the beginning of the season Mike Adamson (WRRS) and James McPhail (CRRS) have been added to this list.

The Assistant Refereeing Group as at the beginning of the season comprised the following assistant referees:

**High Performance Development Group**
Stephen Hart and Stephen Ward

**Group 1**
Graham Allen, Willie Anderson, Brian Darling, Digby Thomas and Gus Tweedale. Since the beginning of the season David Crudge has been repositioned into this group from the Group 2 list.

**Group 2**
David Crudge, Graeme Eastland, Ben Evans, Walter Gaffney, John Hawyrluk, Andrew Laing, Andy Law, Kevin McGhee, Don McPherson, Derek Paton, Brett Primrose, James Taylor and David Wright

**Trialist List**
Stephen Whitehead

**Reserve List**
Iain Bruce and Bill Mitchell
The SRU AR groups officiate mainly at Premiership and National level but may also be appointed to other matches at professional level if required.

There have been very few external appointments since the beginning of the season apart from a team of three (Cammy Rudkin, Gary Gordon and David Crudge) officiating at the Germany v Poland FIRA International. The following is a note of appointments (excluding domestic league and home B+I Cup matches) carried out by SRU Referees and Assistant Referees up to the end of November 2013.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FIRA &amp; other Internationals</th>
<th>Heineken Cup</th>
<th>Amlin CC</th>
<th>Rabo</th>
<th>Exchanges</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dave Changleng</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1 (AR)</td>
<td>1 (AR)</td>
<td>4 (AR)</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gary Gordon</td>
<td>1 (AR)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gordon Corry</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duncan McClement</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cammy Rudkin</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dan Shaw</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graeme Wells</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Crudge (AR)</td>
<td>1 (AR)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen Hart (AR)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stephen Ward (AR)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In addition, Duncan McClement officiated at the FIRA-AER U19 Championship Competition in Lisbon during November.
Performance Reviewers’ Group

This new group was formed at the start of the season to report directly to the Selection Panel on the performance of referees under the Panel’s control.

The group consists of Andy Clift, Johnny Bacigalupo, Jim Fleming, Douglas Kerr, Gordon McMurray, Fergus Neil and Stuart Thomson. In addition two selectors, Ronnie Dumma and Adam Gray are invited to join the group given they also produce reports for the Selection Panel. As well as reporting on domestic matches, four members of the group namely Andy Clift, Jim Fleming, Gordon McMurray and Fergus Neil, undertake performance reviews of referees at the professional, representative and B+I Cup level, whilst Johnny Bacigalupo also reviews referees at B+I Cup and Representative Level.

All referees under the remit of the Selection Panel (plus some non panel referees) are due to have been watch at least once up to the end of November. By the end of November over 70 reports will have been produced for the Selection Panel

Matches up to the end of November, excluding domestic rugby but including home B+I Cup games, to which Performance Reviewers have been appointed, are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>IRB Internationals</th>
<th>Heineken Cup</th>
<th>Amlin CC</th>
<th>Rabo</th>
<th>B+I Cup</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Andy Clift</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnny Bacigalupo</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Fleming</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gordon McMurray</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fergus Neil</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Summary of Season to Date

The Selection Panel continues to move forward in a very positive way and I would like to thank all members of the panel for the commitment they have shown.

We are delighted to see that some referees and ARs have been performing well. It is pleasing to note that some of the district referees who have had to be used at Championship level have also shown potential. The Selection Panel feels that this augurs well for the future.

However there are three concerns that have been causing the Selection Panel some angst.

- The high level of unavailability amongst match officials
- The number of referees required to fulfil appointments which come under the remit of the Selection Panel
The ongoing problem with the late notification of date/time changes of fixtures (usually on International days)

Our main concern revolves around the high level of unavailability amongst both referees and, to a lesser extent, assistant referees.

I reported figures of non-availability of referees and assistant referees to the meeting of senior match officials held at Murrayfield at the end of October. Whilst appreciating that late call-offs do happen due to unforeseen circumstances, I am somewhat concerned that there appears to have been little improvement in recent weeks. Due to the unavailability situation, the Selection Panel have had to regularly appoint listed district referees to Championship which in turn has a knock-on effect with appointments within the districts.

Also of concern is the number of referees currently of grade 4 and above. These are the referees classified as SRU list referees and who are available for Championship League rugby and above. With only 29 referees currently within these grades and with 25 referees required every week to service the domestic leagues (20 referees + 5 referees as AR1 in Premiership matches), one can appreciate the complication that arises with appointments when referees are unavailable or call-off. In the forthcoming weeks, the Selection Panel will be appointing, and reviewing, referees not currently on the SRU list to championship and cup matches in order to evaluate their potential to join the SRU referees’ list.

As was the case last season, the problem with the notification of dates and/or times of fixtures being changed late in the day continues to be a problem both for the Selection Panel and match officials. Fergus Neil, our representative on the Council and Board has agreed to raise the matter at Council whilst Roy McCombe has also raised the problem internally with other SRU officials.

I thank you for taking the time to read this interim report and I am, of course, available to answer any questions or to clarify any points

Jim Fleming
Chairman of the SRU Match Officials’ Selection Panel
November 2013